



# **Mongolia: Smart Government II Project**

## **STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PLAN**

**Ministry of Digital Development and Communications**

**Project Implementation Unit**

**2024**

## Contents

1. Introduction .....	3
2. Project Description .....	4
3. Stakeholder Engagement Program .....	5
4. Methodology .....	10
5. Stakeholder Engagement Activities during project preparation .....	13
6. Information disclosure .....	14
7. Monitoring and Reporting .....	15
8. Grievance Mechanism .....	16
9. Implementation Arrangement, Capacity plan and Resources .....	17
ANNEX A. Consultative Meeting Agenda .....	19
ANNEX B. Stakeholder Engagement Summary (Dec 2021) .....	20
ANNEX C. Consultative Meeting Participants (Dec 2021) .....	22

## 1. Introduction

This document is the Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP) for the Smart Government II Project (hereafter "the Project"). The overall objective of this SEP is to define a program for stakeholder engagement, including public information disclosure and consultation, throughout the entire project cycle. The SEP outlines the ways in which the project team will communicate with stakeholders and includes a mechanism by which people can raise concerns, provide feedback, or make complaints about project and any activities related to the Project. The involvement of the local population is essential to the success of the Project to ensure smooth collaboration between project staff and local communities and to minimize and mitigate environmental and social risks related to the proposed project activities. The SEP will be available on the websites of the Ministry of Digital Development and Communications and Project Implementation Unit of the Project.

It is proposed for the World Bank (hereafter "the Bank") to provide \$40.7 million in International Development Association (IDA) credit, to the Mongolian Ministry of Finance for the Project. The executing agency is the Ministry of Digital Development and Communications. Its beneficiary agencies such as Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia, Ministry of Economy and Development, Ministry of Environment and Tourism, the Ministry of Finance, and the General Authority of State Registration will be coordinated for relevant component/subcomponent and sectoral activities under the leadership of the Ministry of Digital Development and Communications.

The SEP has been prepared based on consultation with the project stakeholders<sup>1</sup> and desk research on stakeholders. The SEP identifies project stakeholders, the methods for information distribution and consultations during the life of the Project and the approach to grievance redress.

The key objectives of the stakeholder engagement according to the World Bank's ESF, World Bank Environmental and Social Standard (ESS) 10<sup>2</sup> are:

- To establish a systematic approach to stakeholder engagement that will help identify stakeholders and build and maintain a constructive relationship with them, Project affected parties.
- To assess the level of stakeholder interest and support for the Project and to enable stakeholders' views to be considered in project design and environmental and social performance.
- To promote and provide means for effective and inclusive engagement with project-affected parties throughout the project life cycle on issues that could potentially affect them.
- To ensure that appropriate project information on environmental and social risks and impacts is disclosed to stakeholders in a timely, understandable, accessible, and appropriate manner and format.

---

<sup>1</sup> A "Stakeholder" refers to individuals or groups who: (a) are affected or likely to be affected by the Project (project-affected parties); and (b) may have an interest in the Project (other interested parties).

<sup>2</sup> Environmental and Social Framework for IPF Operations. *ESS10: Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure*, 2018.

- To provide project-affected parties with accessible and inclusive means to raise issues and grievances and allow project implementer to respond to and manage such grievances.

The World Bank's ESF, includes Environmental and Social Standard (ESS) 10, "Stakeholder Engagement and Information Disclosure", which recognizes "the importance of open and transparent engagement between the Borrower and project stakeholders as an essential element of good international practice". Stakeholders had been identified at preliminary level and the SEP had been disclosed for public review and comment since November 2021, before the Project got appraised by the World Bank in December 2021. ESS10 also requires the development and implementation of a grievance redress mechanism (GRM). The national regulatory requirements as well as those under the ESF are incorporated herein.

In addition to the World Bank Environmental and Social Standard (ESS) 10, there are national requirements for stakeholder engagement regulations. Mongolian regulatory requirements for consultation and disclosure are also considered herein.

It is proposed for the World Bank to provide financing for the Project and as such environmental and social assessments and other planning documentation is needed for the Project to meet the requirements of the World Bank's Environmental and Social Framework (ESF) effective since October 1, 2018. The various assessments and instruments for the Project will include:

- Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP, all project components)
- Environmental Code of Practice (ECOP, all project components)
- Labor Management Procedure (LMP, all project components)
- Environmental and Social Commitment Plan (ESCP, all project components)
- Social Impact Assessment (SIA assesses the potential social impacts arising from the Project activities, as well as social criteria and findings to inform the Project activity designs).

## 2. Project Description

The Government of Mongolia has undertaken various digital development initiatives over the past decades to benefit the country. The ongoing/original Smart Government project (P130891, US\$19.4m), one of the most recent, between 2015 and 2022, implemented by Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia to improve accessibility, transparency, and efficiency of public service in Mongolia. This ongoing project has developed numerous benefits to people laying the basic digital foundations and achieved all its results before its completion in August 2022. The follow-up Smart Government II Project, and its design built on the achievements and implementation experiences of the ongoing/original project. Not only it scales-up and brings Mongolia's digital government to the next phase of a whole-of-government approach for digitalization, but it also expands the scope to include the development of a digital economy for the country's economic diversification and competitiveness, and for digital-enabled jobs and growth.

The Project Development Objective (PDO) of this Project is to improve the quality and efficiency of online public services to citizens and businesses, and to increase digital skills and digital-enabled jobs. The Project has five components as described below.

**Table 14. Project components and subcomponents.**

<i>Component</i>	<i>Subcomponent</i>
<p><b>Component 1: Enabling Environment for Digital Transformation</b> (\$3 million)</p> <p>This component will strengthen the policies and regulations for digital government, economy and connectivity as the enabling environment for Mongolia's digital transformation. It will carry out change and stakeholder management for the public sector to mainstream the adoption of the shared infrastructure and platform. Lastly, this component will promote online engagements and participation of citizens through to promote online citizenry and engagements in public policies.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 1.1. Strengthen Policies and Regulations for Digital Transformation and Connectivity.</li> <li>• 1.2. Change and Stakeholder Management for the Public Sector.</li> <li>• 1.3. Promote Online Engagement/Participation of Citizens.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Component 2: Transforming Digital Government</b> (\$20 million)</p> <p>This component will increase the number and quality of online public services into the e-Mongolia Portal. This will lead to a wider set of services and a better user experience for the citizens. It will upgrade the government's two national-level data centers into a national cloud computing platform to accelerate digital transformation through an efficient, robust, and secured digital infrastructure that is more energy efficiency. This component will set up a national cybersecurity emergency response team (to monitor and safeguard the GoM's critical information infrastructure and digital assets).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2.1. Increase and Improve Digital Public Services in the e-Mongolia Portal.</li> <li>• 2.2. Upgrade GoM's National and Disaster Recovery Data Centers.</li> <li>• 2.3. Set up a Cybersecurity Emergency Response Team (CERT).</li> </ul>
<p><b>Component 3: Growing the Digital Economy</b> (\$16 million)</p> <p>This component will provide (i) digital skills training for public officials and citizens, (ii) create 3,000 digital-enabled jobs for youths (especially women) and (iii) support Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) to adopt digital solutions to improve their productivity, competitiveness, and operational resiliency.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 3.1. Digital Skills Training for Government and Citizens.</li> <li>• 3.2. Digital-enabled Jobs for 3,000 Youths.</li> <li>• 3.3. Support Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) to adopt digital solutions</li> </ul>
<p><b>Component 4: Project Management Support</b> (\$2 million; including GoM's \$1 million in-kind financing)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 4.1. Project Implementation Unit (PIU) Setup and Operations</li> </ul>
<p><b>Component 5: Contingent Emergency Response Component (\$0)</b></p> <p>A CERC is added to the project structure.</p>	<p>This will have an initial zero value but may be financed during the Project's implementation to allow for an agile response to eligible crisis or emergency.</p>

### 3. Stakeholder Engagement Program

Stakeholder engagement is an inclusive process conducted throughout the project life cycle. The stakeholder engagement aims to support developing strong, constructive, and responsive relationships that are important for successfully managing a project's environmental and social risks. Stakeholder engagement is most effective when initiated at an early stage of the project development process. It is an

integral part of early project decisions and the assessment, management, and monitoring of the Project's environmental and social risks and impacts.

Project stakeholders are defined as individuals, groups or other entities who:

- (i) are impacted or likely to be impacted directly or indirectly, positively or adversely, by the Project (also known as 'affected parties'); and
- (ii) may have an interest in the Project ('interested parties'). They include individuals or groups whose interests may be affected by the Project and who have the potential to influence the Project outcomes in any way.

Cooperation and negotiation with the stakeholders throughout the Project development often also require the identification of persons within the groups who act as legitimate representatives of their respective stakeholder group, i.e., the individuals who have been entrusted by their fellow group members with advocating the groups' interests in the process of engagement with the Project. Community representatives may provide helpful insight into the local settings and act as main conduits for dissemination of the Project-related information and as a primary communication/liaison link between the Project and targeted communities and their established networks. Especially for Indigenous People, stakeholder engagement shall be conducted in partnership with Indigenous Peoples' organizations and local community authorities.

Verification of stakeholder representatives (i.e., the process of confirming that they are legitimate and genuine advocates of the community they represent) remains an important task in establishing contact with the community stakeholders. Legitimacy of the community representatives can be verified by talking informally to a random sample of community members and heeding their views on who can be representing their interests in the most effective way.

An initial list of project stakeholders, their interests, and the preferred methods to engage with each group had been developed and agreed by internal project stakeholders in December 2021. A list of stakeholders to be consulted is presented in Table 2.

**Table 2. Stakeholder identification and analysis**

Stakeholder	Role in the Project	Interest	Influence
Ministry of Digital Development and Communications	Executing and implementation agency: Technical design, permits, project steering committee lead, implementing the project	High	High
World Bank	Financing of the Project.	High	High
	Follow up on the fulfilment of the objectives of the Project.		

Stakeholder	Role in the Project	Interest	Influence
The Cabinet Secretary of Mongolia	Key implementing agency: Technical design, permits, project steering committee member	High	High
The General Authority of State Registration	Key beneficiary recipient agency: Technical design, permits, developing and implementing the sub project	High	Medium
Ministry of Environment and Tourism (MoET)	Key beneficiary recipient agency: Technical design, permits, project steering committee member The MoET will provide environmental clearances and may undertake inspections and monitoring at their discretion.	High	Medium
Ministry of Finance	Follow up on the fulfilment of the Minister's Regulation International Development Association General Conditions for Credits and Grants, dated December 14, 2018 (Revised on August 1, 2020, April 1, 2021, and January 1, 2022 on utilization of proceeds of external debts incurred by the Government of Mongolia; implementation, administration, financing, monitoring and evaluation of projects and programs funded by such proceeds.	High	High
Ministry of Economy and Development	Inclusion on Public Investment Project plan and development strategy Coordination in project design and implementation Technical design, permits, project steering committee member	High	Medium

Stakeholder	Role in the Project	Interest	Influence
Independent Authority Against Corruption	Potential technical agency supporting the Project: Technical design, project development	High	Low
State Procurement Agency	Potential technical agency supporting the Project: Technical design inputs High Low	High	Low
National Academy for Governance	Potential technical agency supporting the Project: Technical design inputs	Medium	Low
Ministry of Education and Science	Potential technical agency supporting the Project: Technical design inputs	Medium	Low
Small and Medium Enterprise Agency	Potential technical agency supporting the Project: Technical design inputs	Medium	Low
Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare	Coordination and Technical design inputs	Medium	Medium
Municipality of Ulaanbaatar City and Aimag authorities and its local public service agencies	Participate in the project implementation, contributing to the project	Medium	Low
Project Steering Committee	The Project Steering Committee will be headed by the State Secretary of Ministry of Digital Development and Communications and will be made up from the heads of relevant technical agencies; including Directors of Ministries, Chairs of authorities, and/or their designees from MDDC, Cabinet Secretariat, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Economy Development and Ministry of Environment and Tourism.	High	High
Project Implementation Unit	Lead project implementation	High	High



Stakeholder	Role in the Project	Interest	Influence
Contractor/s	Project partners	High	High
	Participate in the project implementation		
Consultants/Advisors	Project partners	Medium	Medium
	Participate in the project implementation		
Local education and research institutes (University of Science and Technology, National University of Mongolia, Academy of Science, public and private training institutes/centers etc.)	Potential project partners	Medium	Low
	Participate in the project design and implementation		
NGOs and Interests groups (Youth and Women oriented organizations, ICT professional associations, tech savies, Associations of People with Disability, ethnic minority education right activists, Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and its business councils, skills development international NGOs., etc)	Potential project partners	Medium	Medium
	Participate in project design and implementation		
Beneficiary public entities (state owned enterprises like IT park, Innovation hubs, ICT units in public organizations and public service providers, etc.)	Participate in project design and implementation	High/Affected	Low
Beneficiary private entities (local and international ICT businesses, startups, ICT good suppliers and software developers,	Participate in project design and implementation	High/Affected	Low

Stakeholder	Role in the Project	Interest	Influence
consulting firms, SMEs, tourism entities etc.)			
Beneficiary citizens, living in urban and rural setting	Participate in project design and implementation	High/Affected	Low
Project beneficiary-potential vulnerable group as an individual and collective group (possibly such as ethnic minority groups, rural citizens, women, people with disability, youth)	Participate in project design and implementation	High/Affected	Low
Ministry of Family, Labour and Social Protection	Participate in project implementation	High/Affected	Low
General Authority for Development of Persons with Disabilities	Participate in project implementation	High/Affected	Low
Division of Child and Youth Development	Participate in project implementation	High/Affected	Low
Ministry of Culture, Sports, Tourism and Youth	Participate in project implementation	High/Affected	Low
Donor and development partners operating in Mongolia (United Nations and its entities in Mongolia, ADB, EU and other country delegation offices and bilateral agencies, etc.)	Coordination in project design and implementation	High	Low

## 4. Methodology

To meet best practice approaches, the Project will apply the following principles for stakeholder engagement:

- *Openness and life-cycle approach*: public consultations for the Project (s) will be arranged during the whole life cycle, carried out openly, free of external manipulation, interference, coercion, or intimidation.
- *Informed participation and feedback*: information will be provided to and widely distributed among all stakeholders in an appropriate format; opportunities are provided for communicating stakeholders' feedback, for analyzing and addressing comments and concerns.
- *Inclusiveness and sensitivity*: The participation process for the Project shall be inclusive. First, PMO shall coordinate equal access to information for all stakeholders. Sensitivity to stakeholders' needs is the fundamental principle underlying the selection of engagement methods. PMO shall also highlight the inclusion of vulnerable groups, particularly the elderly, diverse ethnic groups, and persons with disabilities.
- *Flexibility*: if social distancing inhibits traditional forms of engagement, the methodology should adapt to other forms of engagement with the stakeholders, including individual telephone calls, and various possible forms of internet communication.
- *Various stakeholder engagement tools will be available*.

For effective and tailored engagement, stakeholders of the proposed Project (s) can be divided into the following core categories:

*Affected Parties* – persons, groups, and other entities within the Project's area of influence that are directly influenced (actually or potentially) by the Project and/or have been identified as most susceptible to change associated with the Project and who need to be closely engaged in identifying impacts and their significance, as well as in decision-making on mitigation and management measures. The identified affected parties are comprised of following groups but not limited to the following:

- Central and local government bodies including direct and indirect beneficiaries
- Public service providers including contracted private service providers
- Training and capacity building institutes
- State owned enterprisers and contracted private entities
- Private sector
- SMEs, ICT and service industry
- Citizens and public service users

*Other Interested Parties* – individuals/groups/entities that may not experience direct impacts from the Project but who consider or perceive their interests as being affected by the Project and/or who could affect the Project and the process of its implementation in some way. The potential interested parties can be:

- Community groups, active NGOs, and professional associations
- Academia and training institutes
- Development partners and bi and multilateral donor agencies
- Media
- Private sector including international enterprisers

*Vulnerable Groups* – persons who may be disproportionately impacted or further disadvantaged by the Project (s) as compared with any other groups due to their vulnerable status, and that may require special engagement efforts to ensure their equal representation in the consultation and decision-making process associated with the Project.

Disadvantaged/vulnerable individuals or groups. It is essential to understand whether project impacts may disproportionately fall on disadvantaged or vulnerable individuals or groups. The vulnerability may stem from a person's origin, gender, age, health condition, economic deficiency and financial insecurity, disadvantaged status in the community (e.g., minorities or fringe groups), dependence on other individuals, or natural resources. Engagement with vulnerable groups and individuals often requires specific measures and assistance to facilitate their participation in project-related decision-making.

Based on the SIA findings, the vulnerable or disadvantaged groups shall be specified and confirmed, and current list may include and are not limited to the following:

- Youth
- Women
- Elderly
- Poor
- Low income and single headed households
- Temporary residents (rural migrants) without regular electricity or/and internet access
- Ethnic minority households
- Persons with disabilities (PWD)
- Small business enterprises
- Herders
- Remote and ger area residents

Vulnerable Groups are persons who may be disproportionately impacted or further disadvantaged by the project(s) as compared with any other groups due to their vulnerable status, and that may require special engagement efforts to ensure their equal representation in the consultation and decision-making process associated with the project(s). Vulnerable status may stem from an individual's or group's race, national, ethnic, or social origin, color, gender, language, religion, political or other opinion, property, age, culture, literacy, sickness, physical or mental disability, poverty or economic disadvantage, and dependence on unique natural resources.

Engagement with Persons with Disabilities. Accessible means of communication is different for each group. Following are examples:

- People who are deaf may require sign language interpretation to understand what is going on at the meeting. People who use hearing aids may require a loop system. A loop system facilitates hearing at large meetings.
- People with learning disabilities may require easy-to-read (which are simplified) versions of documents to enable their comprehension of technical details.

- People with mental health difficulties may benefit from pre-meeting contact to overcome their fears of being stigmatized within the gathering. Dealing with concerns about stigmatization will assist the inclusion of all marginalized groups in society.
- People with mobility disabilities using a wheelchair will require a ramp or level access to a building, a lift instead of staircases, sufficient room to move inside the building, and accessible toilet facilities.

The SEP has been prepared in a manner consistent with the ESS7 to enable targeted meaningful consultation, including identification and involvement of Indigenous People communities and their representative bodies and organizations; culturally appropriate engagement processes; providing sufficient time for Indigenous Peoples decision making processes; and allowing their effective participation in the design of project activities or mitigation measures that could affect them either positively or negatively. The culturally appropriate engagement processes will continue to be considered as a Kazakh-speaking minority group is 3.8 percent, while other small minorities and indigenous groups, Buriad, Tuva, Urianhai, and Khotons, represents between 0.4-1.4 percent of the population. The GRM will be culturally appropriate and accessible for IPs, taking into account their customary dispute settlement mechanism.

## 5. Stakeholder Engagement Activities during project preparation

Before transfer of the Implementing Agency to MDDC, the Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia has identified the different stakeholders, both project-affected parties and other interested parties who may have different concerns and priorities about project impacts, mitigation mechanisms and benefits, and who may require different, or separate, forms of engagement. Before project appraisal, a draft of the SEP was expected to be disclosed as early as possible for the views of stakeholders on the SEP, including on the identification of stakeholders and the proposals for future engagement. If significant changes are made to the SEP, its updated version will be disclosed. Early findings of SIA has been incorporated, and initial lists of key informants had been validated upon. List of screening and a consultative meeting/s had been undertaken during project preparation before the appraisal by WBG as of December 22, 2021, and summarized on the next table. Summary information on stakeholder consultation provided in annex A, B and C.

**Table 3. Summary of Stakeholder Engagement Activities (continues to be updated)**

Stakeholder (Invited participants)	Topics	Responsibility	When	Summary of feedback
<b>Executing/ Implementation and beneficiary agencies</b>	Overall project concept, ESF and its relevant instruments requirements, review of draft ESF documents	Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia, PIU and its external consultants	November 23-December 03, 2021	Newly established working group members briefed on developed ESF instruments and provided their written feedback. Each

Stakeholder (Invited participants)	Topics	Responsibility	When	Summary of feedback
	and engagement mechanisms.			ES instruments incorporated those comments.
<b>Civil society and community groups</b> (equal number of male and female representatives of key target groups including women, youth, people with disability, ethnic minorities, rural citizens, business communities, tech savvies, startups, cooperatives, SMEs, local think tanks etc.)	Overall project concept, potential environment and social risks and impacts.	Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia, PIU and its external consultants	December 17, 2021	Please refer <b>Annex A, B and C.</b>
<b>Relevant government agencies, local Government, and education institutes</b> (equal number of male and female representatives to be invited)	Overall project concept and potential environment and social risks and impacts.	Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia, PIU and its external consultants	December 17, 2021	Please refer <b>Annex A, B and C.</b>

## 6. Information disclosure

The previous/original SMART Government Project (2015-2022) has a website: <http://www.smart.gov.mn/en/> dedicated to disclosing project documents, including those on environmental and social safeguards. The draft SEP, ESCP, ECOP, and LMP got disclosed for the first time on 26<sup>th</sup> of November 2021 at PIU's website <https://www.smart.gov.mn/mn/draftenvsocialdocs/> and consequently on 29<sup>th</sup> of November at Cabinet Secretariat's website: <https://cabinet.gov.mn/5943.html>. Between November 25 and December 05, 2021, several feedback on the draft documents have been received and incorporated. Revised documents shall be available on the same disclosure link on project website as well as MDDC's official webpage by July 31 2023. Besides the draft disclosure documents (and the final documents in future), project brochures and updates will also be posted. In addition, the site will provide details about the Grievance Redress Mechanism and contact details for the PIU. Once new PIU under the MDDC gets established, it is expected to update and maintain the same project website regularly.

Table 4. Proposed strategy for Information disclosure

Project stage	Target stakeholders	List of information to be disclosed	Methods and timing proposed
Project preparation	Government entities; local NGOs representing women, people with disability, youth and ethnic minorities; gender and sector experts; vulnerable groups;	SEP, relevant E&S documents; GRM procedure;	Public notices and disclosure of relevant instruments on project and government websites; Consultation meetings; Separate focus group meetings with vulnerable groups, as appropriate.
Project implementation	Government entities; local NGOs representing women, people with disability, youth and ethnic minorities; gender and sector experts; vulnerable groups;	SEP, relevant E&S documents; GRM procedure; Project Implementation.	Public notices and disclosure of relevant instruments on project and government websites; Electronic publications and press releases on the Project and government website; Dissemination of hard copies at designated public locations; Press releases in the local and social media; Consultation meetings; Information leaflets and brochures; Separate focus group meetings with vulnerable groups, as appropriate.

Distribution of the disclosure materials will be available at venues and locations frequented by the community and places to which public have unhindered access. Free printed copies of the SEP, ESCP, ECOP, LMP and SIA in Mongolian will be made accessible for the public at the PIU office. A strategy for information disclosure will be developed and in place once the project activities kick off.

## 7. Monitoring and Reporting

The Monitoring, Evaluation and Safeguards specialist and Communications Officers under the supervision of the Project coordinator will be responsible for monitoring and reporting on stakeholder engagement activities. The PIU will continue to conduct stakeholder engagement in accordance with this SEP and will

build upon the channels of communication and engagement already established with stakeholders. In particular, the PIU will seek feedback from stakeholders on the environmental and social performance of the project, and the implementation of the mitigation measures in the ESCP.

Consultation and disclosure activities will also be summarized and reported in semi-annual project reports to the World Bank. Several Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) will also be monitored by the PIU on a regular basis, including the following parameters:

- Number of consultation meetings and other public discussions/forums conducted within a reporting period (e.g., monthly, quarterly, or annually).
- Frequency of public engagement activities.
- Number of public grievances received within a reporting period (e.g., monthly, quarterly, or annually) and number of those resolved within the prescribed timeline.
- Type of public grievances received; and
- Number of press materials published/broadcasted in the national media.

## 8. Grievance Mechanism

Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) provides an effective approach for resolution of environment and social related complaints and issues of the affected person/community. The GRM will be introduced during community consultations and made publicly available in Mongolian language to stakeholders throughout the Project. In the event of a grievance issue, up to four stages will be implemented, as follows.

**Stage 1:** Resolution at Local Level and Access to GRM. The GRM system enables affected person (local residents, representatives of local business entities, workers of contractors etc.) to issue a complaint and/or comments choosing the most comfortable way out of several options such as hotline, in-person, written within the existing government procedure. The complaint record includes details such as the comments/grievance issue, the affected person's name, contact and date of grievance.

**Stage 2:** Complaint Eligibility Assessment and Resolution. Received complaint is assigned to the relevant personnel either in PIU or to the relevant department/division/unit in the MDDC. The PIU should take steps to investigate and resolve the issue. This may involve instructing the contractor to take corrective actions. The contractor should implement the redress solution and convey the outcome to the PIU and notify WB. Depending on the type and complexity of the grievance issue, PIU/The MDDC can solve the issue between 1-30 days after receiving the comment/complaint.

**Stage 3:** Complaint Resolution by Project Steering Committee. PIU investigates and organizes multi-stakeholder meeting within 10 days of Stage 3 if necessary.

**Stage 4:** Higher Authority Resolution. If complaint not addressed, affected parties may seek legal redress through court system.



The ongoing/original Smart Government Project has a well-established project level grievance redress mechanism (GRM) for the public and it will be used continuously during SMART II project. The PIU receive and registers feedback/inquiries or grievances via following channels:

- Email: [info@smart.gov.mn](mailto:info@smart.gov.mn)
- Telephone: Tel: Communication: 976-51-261068, Procurement: 976-51-261268
- Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/smartgov2mongolia/>
- In-person visit to PIU office or
- Website: <http://www.smart.gov.mn/mn/feedback/>

The PIU will also prepare a GRM report in Eng and Mongolian and disclose it in project website.

The project communication officer will have primary responsibility to manage project level GRM including receiving, registering, acknowledging the receipts, taking follow-up action and finally respond back and register the status of case in the GRM Log (See table 5).

**Table 5. Grievance Log Template**

No.	Status	Received date	Person/s	Grievance type and received channel	Summary of grievance	1 <sup>st</sup> level resolution and closure date	2 <sup>nd</sup> level resolution and closure date	Assigned PIU staff name
1								
2								

At any time, if the project grievance redress mechanism is considered inadequate for addressing concerns then the World Bank Grievance Redress Service and the World Bank's Inspection Panel are avenues for appeal. Information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank's corporate Grievance Redress Service (GRS), can be found at <http://www.worldbank.org/GRS>. Information on how to submit complaints to the World Bank Inspection Panel, can be found at [www.inspectionpanel.org](http://www.inspectionpanel.org).

## 9. Implementation Arrangement, Capacity plan and Resources

As the requirements of the World Bank's ESF has become effective since October 1, 2018 and is new experience to the Ministry of Digital Development and Communications and its teams' current capacity on preparation and implementation of the E&S instruments is considered low. The MDDC and PIU will have dedicated staff to implement stakeholder engagement activities and arrange necessary training associated with the implementation of this SEP.

In addition to implementation of SEP, the and the project will also pay attention to build the capacity of CS/PIU on implementation of E&S instruments in accordance with the WB's ESSs of ESF.

During the implementation stage, E&S training and guidance will be provided to the government bodies and its relevant stakeholders. Specific target groups for the key training for a beginning program are proposed in Table 5.

**Table 6. Safeguard training at the beginning of Project Implementation**

No	Contents	Target Groups for Training
1	ESF concept and ESSs, and preparation, implementation, monitoring, and reporting of ESCP, SEP, LMP, GRM, and ECOP	PIU, Beneficiary agencies, individual or firm consultants
2	ESCP, SEP, LMP preparation and monitoring including contract management and capacity improvement	PIU, Beneficiary agencies, individual or firm consultants, and contractors
3	Environmental and social monitoring skills improvement	PIU, contractors, environmental and social consultants, and relevant government authority

**Resource:** Funding resources of \$ 100.000 will be allocated from component 4 of project to implement activities in SEP including operationalizing GRM, organizing consultation, and disclosing project documents to the relevant stakeholders.

## ANNEX A. Consultative Meeting Agenda

Time	Agenda
09:00-09:10	Opening
09:10-09:25	Brief presentation on Smart Government II project
09:25-09:45	Brief introduction of the draft environmental and social impact document to be implemented during the Smart Government II project implementation phase <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Stakeholder Engagement Plan-Draft document</li><li>• Labor Management Procedure-Draft document</li><li>• Environmental Code of Practice-Draft document</li><li>• Environmental and Social Commitment Plan-Draft document</li></ul>
09:45-10:45	Questions, Answers and Suggestions <i>Participants</i>
10:45-11:00	Closing

## ANNEX B. Stakeholder Engagement Summary (Dec 2021)

<b>Part I. ENGAGEMENT WORKSHOP WITH NON-GOVERNMENT STAKEHOLDERS</b>	
<b>DISCUSSED TOPIC</b>	<b>RECEIVED KEY FEEDBACK POINTS</b>
<b>Digital literacy</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To target herders to be involved in online communication and daily businesses such as accessing employment documents.</li> <li>• To provide digital literacy training taking account many families have no digital gadgets and relevant survey results.</li> <li>• To digitalize activities in agricultural sector.</li> <li>• Digital literacy and other capacity building activities can be organized in cooperation with Family and Child Development Center.</li> </ul>
<b>Engagement process</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To expand the structure of the data center at local level.</li> <li>• To upgrade electronic notary.</li> </ul>
<b>Adoption of new legal framework and its implementation</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• With the enactment of the Electronic Digital Signature Act, existing infrastructure needs to be upgraded to identify people for electronic documents.</li> <li>• To amend relevant laws encouraging paper-based business activities.</li> <li>• To create an electronic archive infrastructure.</li> </ul>
<b>Employment and SMEs</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To add more SMEs including services.</li> <li>• To specify the expected outcomes on youth employment support program.</li> <li>• To add specific participation measures for rural and semi urban area people.</li> <li>• To update the communication practices and channels for information dissemination.</li> </ul>
<b>People with disability</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Current legal amendments provide ground for ICT use and a barrier-free environment.</li> <li>• Often people with intellectual disabilities are left out.</li> <li>• To account of specific job settings/requirements and provide flexible job criteria for the employment of PWDs.</li> <li>• To support opportunities for children with disabilities to learn and socialize, and for parents to be self-employed and supportive.</li> <li>• To provide on-the-job training opportunities</li> <li>• It is necessary that PWDs need to look for jobs and find their own.</li> <li>• There are 7 common types of disabilities. There is a single application form for those have multiple disabilities</li> <li>• Rehabilitation centers for disabled people have experienced ICT teachers and regularly provide training.</li> <li>• Personal case: qualified ICT engineer but have been unemployed due to lack of accessible workplace and required job duties and tried to start his business but affected by COVID 19. Experienced learning infrastructure challenges such as accommodation in the city, high cost having a caretaker at present, and limited occupational choices. to work in a team environment.</li> </ul>

Part II. ENGAGEMENT WORKSHOP WITH GOVERNMENT STAKEHOLDERS	
DISCUSSED TOPIC	RECEIVED FEEDBACK KEY POINTS
<b>SMEs</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To specify the target activities for SMEs.</li> <li>• To support SMEs how to run their business in virtual environment since pandemic.</li> <li>• To strengthen their capacity to receive digitalized services.</li> </ul>
<b>Capacity building of Civil Servants</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Limited knowledge and skills affect the outcomes of digital related investments</li> <li>• To conduct systematic capacity building intervention in cooperation with training institutes such as NAOG from identifying needs to training delivery.</li> <li>• To assess the ICT competence of core civil servants.</li> <li>• Civil servants' competence and business process upgrading are interdependent and there is low capacity (30%) among citizens.</li> <li>• Low human resource capacity in general.</li> </ul>
<b>E-MONGOLIA</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To address the shortcomings and configuration issues of launched services on e-Mongolia platform.</li> <li>• To take sufficient preparatory action</li> <li>• To reduce the discrepancies on collected data of citizens and to carry out data cross checking and pilot testing between government agencies.</li> <li>• To display citizens information such as employment support loans, soum development funds, SMEs, etc. in a unified manner, to avoid loan repayment risks due to duplications.</li> <li>• To promote internal information/data sharing within the government bodies. Its internal processes still run-on paper and to upgrade the internal archiving.</li> <li>• To digitalize the state archiving.</li> <li>• To assess changes on civil servants' workload capturing the impact of digital transformation.</li> </ul>

## ANNEX C. Consultative Meeting Participants (Dec 2021)

### Part 1. Government

No.	Organizations	Number of participants
1.	Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia (CS)	3
2.	Ministry of Justice and Home Affairs (MoJHA)	1
3.	Ministry of Environment and Tourism (MET)	1
4.	Communications Information and Technology Agency (CITA)	4
5.	National Data Center (NDC)	1
6.	Small and Medium enterprise Agency	3
7.	National Center for Lifelong Education	2
8.	National Statistics Office (NSO)	1
9.	Land Management, Geodesy, Cartography Agency	2
10.	National Academy of Governance (NAOG)	1
11.	National Development Agency (NDA)	1
12.	General Authority of State Registration (GASR)	6
13.	Registration Department, Municipality of Ulaanbaatar	2
14.	Registration ddepartment, Tuv aimag	1
15.	Small and Medium Production and Service, Municipality of Ulaanbaatar	2
16.	Labor, social welfare service agency, Gobisumber aimag	1
<b>Total number of participants</b>		<b>32</b>

### Part II. Non-government organization, citizen, business entity

No.	Organizations	Number of participants
17.	Private sector/ICT industry representatives	3
18.	NGO representatives	7
19.	Academia	1
20.	SME representatives	4
<b>Total number of participants</b>		<b>15</b>